



Scarborough Public Library - Site Evaluation Summary

At the request of Scarborough Public Library, Simons Architects evaluated four separate sites for use as their new expanded library. SA was to consider expansion at the existing location, another property on the municipal campus currently occupied by tennis courts, relocation in the renovated Scarborough Downs grandstand and a yet to be determined, pad ready, building site within the Scarborough Downs development. Each site was visited and information collected from a variety of sources. As a method of evaluation, SA developed a site matrix outlining a variety of issues. Each of the four sites were graded in each category.

Conclusions:

The matrix grading quickly eliminated both options at Scarborough Downs. The pad ready Scarborough Downs site would not have the same exposure and public presence that the current location and the tennis court site does. While the renovation of the grandstand was a novel possibility, it lacked ease of access and had many unknowns associated with it. Both the existing location and the tennis court site scored well in the matrix. Some of the shortcomings of the tennis court site included wetland and difficulty of permitting, parking pressure and possible conflicts from adjacent sports events, and a less than ideal traffic pattern.

SA also prepared a cost projection with each of the four site options. While the existing location and the tennis court sites scored closely in the matrix, expanding at the current location was significantly cheaper by a margin of \$1.7M. With this, an expansion of the existing library facility on Quentin Drive emerged as the favored location.

POTENTIAL SITE LOCATIONS



**3- SCARBOROUGH DOWNS
GRANDSTAND**

**4- ALTERNATE SITE SCARBOROUGH DOWNS
TO BE DETERMINED**

1- EXISTING SITE

**2- TENNIS COURT
SITE**

Scarborough Public Library Site Selection Matrix

		Existing Library Site Oak Hill Village Neighborhood		Tennis Court Site Oak Hill Village Neighborhood		Scarborough Downs: Grandstand		Scarborough Downs: Alternate Site	
Visibility	Is the building visible from a well traveled way?	Yes, high visibility from Gorham Road traffic.	4	Yes, high visibility from Gorham Road traffic.	4	No, site is buried in the Downs Development.	-3	No, site is buried in the Downs Development. May be close to Haigis Parkway entrance.	-2
	How does the Library location factor into future planning for the Town of Scarborough?	Close proximity to the Municipal Campus, Schools, and the future connection to the Oak Hill Development	3	Close proximity to the Municipal Campus, Schools, and the future connection to the Oak Hill Development	3	Development in the Downs would satisfy the community amenity goal built into the Downs planning requirements.	1	Development in the Downs would satisfy the community amenity goal built into the Downs planning requirements.	1
Easily Accessible									
	Pedestrian Access -Is it connected by a larger system of sidewalks and pathways? Is it safe to access by foot?	There is sidewalk access, although this is not the primary mode of circulation (vehicular is more common). The school and municipal campus is connected via sidewalks to the library	2	There is sidewalk access, although this is not the primary mode of circulation (vehicular is more common). The school and municipal campus is connected via sidewalks to the library	2	Anticipated pedestrian access. System of roads have been laid out in the Downs master plan, further details not yet available.	3	Anticipated pedestrian access. System of roads have been laid out in the Downs master plan, further details not yet available.	3
	Public Transportation -Can a patron arrive by Metro Bus? Current service or a future planned service?	There is a Route 1 bus to Oak Hill, people are able to walk to the library from there. It is anticipated that Gorham Rd. will be included as the GPCOG bus review is completed.	2	There is a Route 1 bus to Oak Hill, people are able to walk to the library from there. It is anticipated that Gorham Rd. will be included as the GPCOG bus review is completed.	2	The main road into the downs has a bus stop, and there are plans to tie-in to the public transportation network (Metro).	2	The main road into the downs has a bus stop, and there are plans to tie-in to the public transportation network (Metro).	2
	Bicycle Access -Connected to defined bike paths	Gorham Road has some marked bike lanes and is in the process of being redesigned. There is a plan for this area.	2	Gorham Road has some marked bike lanes and is in the process of being redesigned. There is a plan for this area.	2	Anticipated bike-friendly site planning.	2	Anticipated bike-friendly site planning.	2
	Vehicle Access -Easy of access to driveways that fit into traffic patterns. Is it easy for a patron to get into and out of the library parking safely.	Yes, the existing site plan allows for easy access from Gorham Road and to Quentin Drive for library parking. New configuration to take into account drive through window.	4	Yes, the existing site plan allows for easy access from Gorham Road and to Wentworth Drive for future library parking. New configuration should study interface of a drive through window, if possible. Note- Wentworth Drive is currently one way out. Left turns cannot be made from that road currently. Traffic study would be needed if site is further considered, intersection distance to Hannaford Drive is in very close proximity.	1	Yes, the existing and proposed site plan should allow for reasonable access from Route 1, Payne Road, and Haigis Parkway into the Downs Campus to the Grandstand site. Development to take into account inclusion of a drive through window.	3	Unknown condition, site to be determined. It would be difficult to speculate the access to the potential site, and whether or not inclusion of a drive through window would be possible without knowing the site relation to the proposed road network.	0
Adjacency	Is the library next door to compatible uses?	Yes. Next to existing schools and well situated for future town growth	3	Yes. Next to existing schools and well situated for future town growth	3	Unknown. Size of the Grandstand would require the library to share the building with other tenants. Some development in progress on residential and senior housing. Scarborough Downs still to be in place next door.	0	Unknown. Future tenants to be determined	0
	Does it make sense in the neighborhood context?								
	What are the impacts on neighbors and abutters? Single story, second story?	Potential drive through- traffic (and delivery and trash collection) noise to residential abutters	-2		0		0		0
	Noise -Is there any issue with nearby noise such as a major highway?	Some traffic noise from Gorham Road.	-1	Some traffic noise from Gorham Road	-1	Unknown until development is realized.	0	Unknown condition, site to be determined. Potential noise from Haigis Parkway	0
Natural Site Limitations	Topography -Significant grade changes or need for filling.	Some existing grade change from one side of the building to the other.	-1				0	Unknown condition, site to be determined.	0
	Wetlands - Have wetlands been mapped? Is there flexibility for mitigation? Have previous DEP permits been granted?	Wetlands are mapped	2					Unknown condition, site to be determined.	0
	Soil Condition	Known condition	2	Unknown condition	0	Unknown condition	0	Unknown condition, site to be determined.	0
	Geotech / sub surface conditions- Will subsurface conditions require excessive foundation costs?							Unknown condition, site to be determined.	0
	Existing Vegetation - Are there mature native trees or planting that can be maintained? Are there invasive plantings that need to be removed?	There are existing mature trees onsite that provide a vegetated buffer with abutters.	4	There are smaller caliper trees onsite near some standing water (wetlands?)	2		0	Unknown condition, site to be determined.	0
Utilities									
	Other Utilities	Have natural gas currently, geothermal at school next door.	2						
Building Related Issues	Existing Building?	Yes, there is an existing building.	0	No, the site currently has tennis courts on it.	2	Yes, the existing Grandstand building fills the site.	-3	No, the site is currently undeveloped.	2
	Renovation or addition required?	Yes, the existing library would require extensive interior renovation as well as an addition, either on the ground level, or on a second floor expansion.	-2	No, new construction only.	3	Yes, extensive renovations would be required. Existing building would be taken down to primary structure and then an entirely new-construction effort would be completed for a new space.	-3	No, new construction only.	3
	Is there an opportunity for a new, purpose built facility?	There is potential for purpose-built expansion area, but there are some existing conditions in place that will have to be worked around.	1	Yes, it would be entirely new construction on this site.	4	Somewhat. The existing grandstand infrastructure limits the footprint and overall building form.	2	Potentially. This parcel has yet to be defined. It would likely be in a development area in which the library would share a building with other tenants. There is some potential design input for the future facility.	2
	Is there an opportunity for future expansion?	Future Expansion would likely require building up. A potential issue for residential neighbors abutting the rear property line.	2	Future Expansion would likely require building up, unless further sprawl towards the basketball courts was a potential.	3	The Grandstand site allows for ample footprint area, offering the potential for a large floor plate, or multi-story design. Immediately adjacent development and tenants unknown.	3	Unknown site constraints, site still to be determined. Future Expansion would likely require building up.	3
Hazardous materials	Has the site or building been tested for hazardous materials? Lead Paint, asbestos, buried tanks, etc.?	Existing library building was completed in 1990. Assumed no abatement required.	5	Not at this time.	0	Unknown, assumed abatement required.	-2	Unknown condition, site to be determined.	0
Parking	Is there room for adequate parking?	Existing parking is insufficient. Redesign of lot (in conjunction with expansion) to be reviewed. Potential ability to gain some adjacent site for greater footprint.	-1	A new lot would be required for this site. Relying on existing parking for sports fields and Wentworth School would be challenging. Significant parking pressure when a sport event happens next door.	-3	Existing Grandstand has ample parking. Once reconfigured into a shared parking model there should still be adequate parking to serve adjacent businesses as well as the library patrons.	2	Unknown site and constraints. To be determined. Shared parking models to be followed in Downs Development.	2
	Is there an opportunity for shared parking?	Yes, there is potential for shared remote spots at the Wentworth School and basketball courts lot.	2	Yes, there is potential for shared parking, but it would often be competing for spaces with Athletic and School Events.	1	Yes, parking would be shared in this location, total number of spots to be determined.	0	Yes, parking would be shared in this location, total number of spots to be determined.	0
Zoning	What is the designated zoning?	TVC2- Town and Village Centers Transition	0	TVC2- Town and Village Centers Transition	0	CPD- Cross Roads Planned Development District	0	CPD- Cross Roads Planned Development District	0
	Does it allow for library use?	Yes (Town Zoning Ordinance: Section XVIII.C- Page 2 9)	5	Yes (Town Zoning Ordinance: Section XVIII.C- Page 2 9)	5	Yes (Town Zoning Ordinance: Section XX.C.- Page 1 10)	5	Yes (Town Zoning Ordinance: Section XX.C.- Page 1 10)	5
Permitting	How difficult will the permitting be? Is there a DEP Application Required?	Permitting is involved but possible	-1	Permitting is difficult due to Campus wide permitting history	-5	Assumed that permitting would be taken care of by Downs Development	1	Assumed that permitting would be taken care of by Downs Development	1
Acquisition		Town owned currently	5	Town owned currently	5	Would require lease or purchase. Very motivated seller.	-1	Would require the parcel be purchased	-3
Construction Relocation		Relocation during construction required	-3		0		0		0
Bonus Points / Observations				Town would have the benefit of the reuse of the current Library building for other municipal uses.	5		0		0
Totals			39		38		12		21

Scarborough Public Library - Site Cost Comparisson

	Existing Library Site Oak Hill Village Neighborhood with one floor expansion at grade Current Planning		Existing Library Site Oak Hill Village Neighborhood with second floor expansion over existing footprint		Tennis Court Site Oak Hill Village Neighborhood		Scarborough Downs: Portion of the Grandstand Renovated for use by the SPL		Scarborough Downs: Alternate Site for a new two story library	
Site work costs	Building expansion would require some stormwater retention and treatment	\$438,000	Reduced footprint would lessen the stormwater retention and treatment. Existing utilities are in place.	\$320,000	Assume wetlands would need to be mitigated. All utilities would need to be extended and connected.	\$580,000	Existing site has utilities in place. Minimum stormwater and permitting issues.	\$0	All utilities and stormwater would be new	\$430,000
Parking	Existing Parking could be reused and expanded upon	\$438,000	Existing parking could be reused and expanded upon	\$438,000	All parking would be new	\$673,000	Existing parking could be shared with other grandstand occupants. Pro-rate contribution to upgrade.	\$200,000	All parking would be new	\$543,000
Building renovation costs	12,884 SF x \$180 SF	\$2,319,000	12,884 SF x \$220 SF Renovation costs higher due to expansion above requiring new structure	\$2,834,480	No renovations		30,552 SF X \$320 SF All construction would be renovation to existing space. Due to the age and condition of the building, cost-wise, all construction should be priced as new.	\$9,776,640	No renovations	
New construction cost	17,116 SF x \$320 SF New expansion at grade	\$5,477,000	17,668 SF x \$320 SF Second floor expansion requiring elevator and two fire stairs	\$5,653,760	30,552 SF x \$320 SF All New Construction. Assume two story with elevator and fire stairs	\$9,776,640	No New Construction	\$0	30,552 SF x \$320 SF All New Construction. Assume two story with elevator and fire stairs	\$9,776,640
Sub Total of Construction Costs		\$8,672,000		\$9,246,240		\$11,029,640		\$9,976,640		\$10,749,640
Land Acquisition Costs		\$0		\$0		\$0		Not yet known		Not yet known
TOTAL		\$8,672,000		\$9,246,240						

Scarborough Public Library - Cost Estimates by Program Size

	30,000 SF Base Program				34,000 SF Base Program		36,000 SF Base Program		40,000 SF Base Program	
	Existing Library Site Oak Hill Village Neighborhood with one floor expansion at grade Current Planning		Existing Library Site renovation of existng with a two story expansion		Existing Library Site renovation of existng with a two story expansion		Existing Library Site renovation of existng with a two story expansion		Existing Library Site renovation of existng with a two story expansion	
Site Costs		\$900,000		\$900,000		\$900,000		\$900,000		\$900,000
Building renovation costs	12,884 SF x \$180 SF	\$2,319,000	12,884 SF x \$180 SF	\$2,319,000	12,884 SF x \$180 SF	\$2,319,000	12,884 SF x \$180 SF	\$2,319,000	12,884 SF x \$180 SF	\$2,319,000
New construction cost	17,116 SF x \$320 SF New expansion at grade	\$5,477,000	18,716 SF x \$320 SF Second floor expansion requiring elevator, two fire stairs, 2nd floor restrooms and misc. support spaces (1,600 additional SF)	\$5,989,120	22,716 SF x \$320 SF Second floor expansion requiring elevator, two fire stairs, 2nd floor restrooms and misc. support spaces (1,600 additional SF)	\$7,269,120	28,716 SF x \$320 SF Second floor expansion requiring elevator, two fire stairs, 2nd floor restrooms and misc. support spaces (1,600 additional SF)	\$9,189,120	32,716 SF x \$320 SF Second floor expansion requiring elevator, two fire stairs, 2nd floor restrooms and misc. support spaces (1,600 additional SF)	\$10,469,120
Sub Total of Construction Costs		\$8,696,000		\$9,208,120		\$10,488,120		\$12,408,120		\$13,688,120
Soft Cost at 22% of Construction Cost		\$1,913,120		\$2,025,786		\$2,307,386		\$ 2,729,786		\$ 3,011,386
TOTAL		\$10,609,120		\$11,233,906		\$12,795,506		\$15,137,906		\$16,699,506